

Recommendations for preparation of manuscripts to be included in doctoral thesis

Adapted from Taylor & Francis Peer review checklist

The board for doctoral education at LIME has created these recommendations for manuscripts' preparation intended for doctoral student and supervisors by the time the candidate is ready to submit his/her application to the Dissertation Committee. The incentive for these recommendations is as a checklist to help the doctoral student to enhance the quality of the manuscript/s to be included in doctoral thesis but that yet not have been published. The recommendations hopefully will assist both in writing the manuscript/s, and prior to preparing to submit the application for public defence or licentiate seminar.

Title

- Does it articulate clearly what the manuscript is about?
- Does it emphasize the importance of the study?
- Does it contain any redundant description?

Abstract

- Is it a concise and clear-cut summary of the aims, key methods, key findings (else preliminary findings), and conclusions?
- Does it include sufficient information to stand alone?
- Does it contain only relevant information?

Introduction

- Does it clearly summarize the current existing knowledge of the topic?
- Does it address the limitations of current knowledge in this field?
- Does it clearly explain why the study is necessary?
- Does it clearly define the aim of the study and is this consistent with the rest of the manuscript?
- If stated, is the research question clear and appropriate?

Methods

- Are the study methods suitable for the research question?

- Is there consistency of evidence (reliability or dependability) using the description in the methods?
- Is there enough detail about the study design and empirical context/setting?
- Is it clear how samples were collected or how participants were recruited?
- Is any potential problem (bias) in the sample or in the recruitment of participants addressed?
- Is the analysis clearly described?
- If relevant, is there sufficient power and appropriate statistics?
- Are there any ethical concerns? In case an ethical permit was granted, please specify the reference number and the committee.

Results

- Do the results correspond with the stated aim of the study?
- Are the results presented clearly and accurately?
- Do the results presented match the methods?
- Have all the relevant data been included?
- Is the data described in the text a) consistent with the data in the figures and tables? or b) illustrated with quotes to support the analysis?

Discussion and conclusion

- Does the manuscript logically explain the findings?
- Does the manuscript compare/contrast the findings with current findings in the research field?
- Are the implications of the findings for future research and potential applications discussed?
- Are methodological considerations discussed?
- Are the conclusions supported by the data presented?
- Are the strengths and weaknesses of the study discussed?
- Are any contradictory results discussed?

Tables and figures

- Are data presented in a clear and appropriate manner?
- Is the presentation of tables and figures consistent with the description in text?
- Do the figure legends and table headings clearly explain what is shown?

- Are tables and figures cited in the text of the manuscript? Consecutively? In the right place?

Please remember that for non-original figures, you need the permission of the authors / copyright owners to reproduce them. For figures published on open access journals credits shall be given. Please refer to that specific journal to see how to do that.

References

- Are there any key references missing?
- Do the you cite the initial discoveries where suitable?
- Are there places where a review is cited but should preferably cite the original paper?
- Do the cited studies represent current knowledge?
- Do the citations in the list of references list follow a specific reference style? Are the references reported in a consistent way? Examples of styles are presented on the KI Library website, "Writing References" (<https://kib.ki.se/en/write-cite/writing-references-apa-vancouver>)

Where to publish

- Together with your supervision team, have you thought about where to publish the manuscript?

Please be aware of journals labelled as "predatory" (questionable journals). To identify them, you can go to KI library website, "Cabell's Predatory Reports" webpage (<https://kib.ki.se/en/databaser/cabells-predatory-reports>) and follow the instructions.

2022-12-20